



## ENVIRONMENT IN THE COURTROOM

Edited by Allan E. Ingelson

ISBN 978-1-55238-986-7

**THIS BOOK IS AN OPEN ACCESS E-BOOK.** It is an electronic version of a book that can be purchased in physical form through any bookseller or on-line retailer, or from our distributors. Please support this open access publication by requesting that your university purchase a print copy of this book, or by purchasing a copy yourself. If you have any questions, please contact us at [ucpress@ucalgary.ca](mailto:ucpress@ucalgary.ca)

**Cover Art:** The artwork on the cover of this book is not open access and falls under traditional copyright provisions; it cannot be reproduced in any way without written permission of the artists and their agents. The cover can be displayed as a complete cover image for the purposes of publicizing this work, but the artwork cannot be extracted from the context of the cover of this specific work without breaching the artist's copyright.

**COPYRIGHT NOTICE:** This open-access work is published under a Creative Commons licence. This means that you are free to copy, distribute, display or perform the work as long as you clearly attribute the work to its authors and publisher, that you do not use this work for any commercial gain in any form, and that you in no way alter, transform, or build on the work outside of its use in normal academic scholarship without our express permission. If you want to reuse or distribute the work, you must inform its new audience of the licence terms of this work. For more information, see details of the Creative Commons licence at: <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>

**UNDER THE CREATIVE COMMONS LICENCE YOU MAY:**

- read and store this document free of charge;
- distribute it for personal use free of charge;
- print sections of the work for personal use;
- read or perform parts of the work in a context where no financial transactions take place.

**UNDER THE CREATIVE COMMONS LICENCE YOU MAY NOT:**

- gain financially from the work in any way;
- sell the work or seek monies in relation to the distribution of the work;
- use the work in any commercial activity of any kind;
- profit a third party indirectly via use or distribution of the work;
- distribute in or through a commercial body (with the exception of academic usage within educational institutions such as schools and universities);
- reproduce, distribute, or store the cover image outside of its function as a cover of this work;
- alter or build on the work outside of normal academic scholarship.



**Acknowledgement:** We acknowledge the wording around open access used by Australian publisher, **re.press**, and thank them for giving us permission to adapt their wording to our policy <http://www.re-press.org>

# Contributors

**PAUL ADAMS**, Senior Counsel, Public Prosecution Service Canada, Halifax

**NATASHA AFFOLDER**, Associate Dean, Faculty of Law, University of British Columbia, Vancouver

**ANDREA C. AKELAITIS**, Letcher Akelaitis LLP, Vancouver

**PETER BOXALL**, Professor, Department of Resource Economics & Environmental Sociology, University of Alberta, Edmonton

**GIORILYN BRUNO**, DLA Piper (Canada) LLP

**JAMES BUNTING**, Davies, Ward, Phillips & Vineberg LLP, Toronto

**CINDY CHIASSON**, Alberta Energy Regulator, Edmonton

**JOHN S.G. CLARK**, Department of Justice, Vancouver

**JOHN D. CLIFFE, Q.C.**, Cliffe Tobias, Vancouver

**LYNDA COLLINS**, Professor, Faculty of Law, Common Law, University of Ottawa

**JACK D. COOP**, Fogler, Rubinoff LLP, Toronto

**CHARLES-EMMANUEL CÔTÉ**, Professor, Faculty of Law, Laval University

**PETER J. CRAIG**, Senior Crown Attorney, Nova Scotia Public Prosecution Service, Dartmouth

**PIERRE-OLIVIER DESMARCHAIS**, Policy Analyst, Policy Horizons Canada, Government of Canada

**ADAM DRIEDZIC**, Staff Counsel, Environmental Law Centre (Alberta) Society, Edmonton

**ERIN EACOTT**, Public Prosecution Service of Canada, Edmonton

**JENNIFER FAIRFAX**, Partner, Osler, Hoskin & Harcourt LLP, Toronto

**JAMES FLAGAL**, Counsel, Ontario Ministry of the Environment and Climate Change, Toronto

**SHAUN FLUKER**, Associate Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Calgary

**HADLEY FRIEDLAND**, Assistant Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Alberta, Edmonton

**PAULE HALLEY**, Professor, Faculty of Law, Laval University

**CHARLES HATT**, Staff Lawyer, Ecojustice, Toronto

**BRENDA HEELAN POWELL**, Staff Counsel, Environmental Law Centre, Edmonton

**NICHOLAS R. HUGHES**, McCarthy Tétrault, Vancouver

**ALEX IKEJIANI**, Department of Justice, Fisheries and Oceans Legal Services, Government of Canada, Ottawa

**ALLAN E. INGELSON**, Associate Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Calgary

**ASHA JAMES**, Managing Associate, Falconers LLP, Toronto

**MEREDITH JAMES**, Environmental Lawyer, City of Toronto

**ALBERT KOEHL**, Former Staff Lawyer, Ecojustice, Toronto

**DAVID LAIDLAW**, Research Fellow, Canadian Institute of Resources Law, Calgary

**JONATHAN LEO**, Former Attorney, State Bar of California

**GARY A. LETCHER**, Letcher Akelaitis LLP, Vancouver

**ALASTAIR R. LUCAS**, Q.C., Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Calgary

**FRED MAEFS**, Crown Counsel, Ontario Ministry of the Environment and Climate Change, Toronto

**SHARON MASCHER**, Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Calgary

**MARC McAREE**, Partner, Willms & Shier Environmental Lawyers LLP, Toronto

**PAUL McCULLOCH**, Crown Counsel, Ministry of the Environment and Climate Change, Ottawa

**HEATHER McLEOD-KILMURRAY**, Professor, Faculty of Law, Common Law, University of Ottawa

**SUSAN McRORY**, Former Environmental Prosecutor, Specialized Prosecutions Branch, Government of Alberta, Edmonton

**DANIELLE MEULEMAN**, Crown Counsel, Ontario Ministry of the Attorney General, Toronto

**NICKIE NIKOLAOU**, Associate Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Calgary

**TERRI-LEE OLENIUK**, Osler, Hoskin & Harcourt LLP, Calgary

**MARTIN OLSZYNSKI**, Associate Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Calgary

**KATIA OPALKA**, Senior Manager, Pratt & Whitney Canada Corp, Quebec

**JEAN PIETTE**, Norton Rose Fulbright, Québec

**SARAH POWELL**, Davies, Ward, Phillips & Vineberg, Toronto

**PHILLIP SAUNDERS**, Professor, Schulich School of Law, Dalhousie University, Halifax

**MONIKA A. SAWICKA**, McCarthy Tétrault, Vancouver

**DR. DIANNE SAXE**, Environmental Commissioner of Ontario, Government of Ontario, Toronto

**CHERYL SHARVIT**, Mandell Pinder LLP, Vancouver

**ANAND SRIVASTAVA**, Associate Lawyer, Willms & Shier Environmental Lawyers LLP, Toronto

**BARRY STUART**, Retired Judge, Vancouver

**JOHN SWAIGEN**, Staff Lawyer, Ecojustice, Toronto

**CHRIS TOLLEFSON**, Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Victoria

**RONDA M. VANDERHOEK**, Counsel, Public Prosecution Service of Canada, Halifax

**JASMINE VAN SCHOUWEN**, Faculty of Law, University of Ottawa

**MICHAEL M. WENIG**, Natural Resources Conservation Board, Calgary

**ROBERT WOON**, Associate Lawyer, Willms & Shier Environmental Lawyers LLP, Toronto

# Index

## A

Aboriginal law, 285  
Aboriginal traditional knowledge, 606–27  
absolute liability offences, 231, 263;  
    corporations, 313, 323, 326, 328, 379,  
    724; deeming, provisions, 475; defences,  
    180–81, 202, 204, 231, 272, 273, 282, 286,  
    282, 301, 726, 736, 740, 768, 773; defined,  
    231; general deterrence, 365, 380, 383,  
    388, 394, 437, 438, 453, 456, 675, 742, 762  
abuse of process, 243, 272–76, 279, 581  
acts of God, 181, 740  
*actus reus*, 177, 197, 203–4, 234, 247, 263, 350,  
    476–77, 720–21, 734  
administrative decisions, 352  
administrative law, 20, 231, 619–20  
administrative orders, 199, 700  
administrative penalties, 338–59  
administrative tribunals, 81, 532, 534, 539,  
    547–48, 559, 593–95  
admissibility of expert evidence and costs,  
    516–30  
assessing environmental damages, 162–68

## B

balance of probabilities, 155, 198, 232, 234,  
    244, 263, 264, 270, 452, 473, 526, 584,  
    586, 591, 592, 639, 720, 721, 734, 756,  
    769, 773  
beyond a reasonable doubt, 197, 205, 219, 226,  
    231–33, 244, 251, 267, 271, 452, 453, 473,  
    575, 720

*Brundtland Report*, 2, 4, 8, 94  
bylaws, 24, 187, 242

## C

*Canada National Parks Act*, 46, 50, 133, 134,  
    135, 138, 423, 445  
*Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms*, 6,  
    13, 72, 178, 255, 342, 344, 348, 358, 478,  
    666, 713, 770  
*Canadian Environmental Assessment Act*, 14,  
    22, 106, 129, 161, 610, 623, 628, 631  
causation and scientific certainty, 473–80  
Certificates of Approval, 194  
classification as strict/absolute liability  
    offence, 180; reverse onus, 198, 719  
*Charter of Human Rights and Freedoms*, 14,  
    72, 75, 77, 80, 348, 358, 360  
citizen participation, 14  
*Civil Code of Quebec*, 44  
civil law, xi, 52, 144, 146, 292  
class action, 56, 58, 67, 71, 190, 560, 654  
classification of offenses: quasi-criminal  
    offence, 205, 668, 726  
*Clean Water Act*, 253, 677, 687–88, 795  
climate change, 233, 144, 646–61  
codes of conduct, 322  
collecting essential evidence, 718–39  
communications between lawyers and  
    experts, 494–503  
compliance regimes, 708–16  
compliance audit, 715, 780  
*Constitution Act 1867*, 143, 289

*Constitution Act 1982*, 13, 140, 186, 286, 287, 296, 609

constitutional jurisdiction, 54; federal jurisdiction, 207, 621; provincial jurisdiction, 207

continuing offences, 428, 745

control, 321, 322; ability to restrain or prevent activities, 321, 322

corporate perspective on creative environmental sentences, 391–408

corporations, liability of, 313, 323, 326, 328, 379, 724; circumstances necessary for conviction, 326, 327; corporate veil, 367; directing minds, 335, 756

cost of compliance: costs, 244, 249, 250, 294, 527, 528

creative sentences, 391, 393, 395, 406, 416–18, 422; in Australia 377–86; negotiation, 436–41; sentencing, 364–72, 377, 381, 384–85, 391–95, 406, 408, 413, 415–18, 420–21, 430, 435, 438, 439. *See also* corporate perspective on creative environmental sentences; non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and creative sentencing

*Criminal Code*, 52, 185, 208, 214, 231, 232, 242, 245, 247–50, 366, 367, 369–70, 372, 425, 446, 692, 743, 765, 771

criminal law of the environment and defences, 272–82

customary international law, 20–21, 29, 75, 80, 102, 142–46, 149–50, 152, 157, 299

## D

damages, 56–57, 59, 166–68, 316, 464

defences, 180, 181, 272, 273, 279, 282; abuse of process, 272; acts of God, 181; officially induced error, 182, 272, 274, 276

directing mind of corporations 335, 756; generally, 756; principles, 756

directors, liability of, 324, 428, 724, 725, 767; statutory duty of care, 329; steps to avoid liability, 181, 723, 737

directors and officers, liability of, 324, 428, 724, 725, 767; legislation imposing positive duty, 724

disclosure of defence evidence, 726, 732

discretionary decisions, 719

due diligence, 180, 181, 262–70, 353, 757; reasonable care, whether exercised, 477, 722–24, 756–57; relationship between due diligence defence and acts of God, 180–81; relationship between due diligence defence and mistake of fact defence, 180–82; relationship between due diligence defence and necessity defence, 272, 279; standard of care. *See* standard of care

duty of care: scope, 188–91, 691

duty to notify and consult, 607, 611, 615, 619–22

## E

ecological integrity, vi, xii, 11, 46, 93, 94, 96, 98, 100, 103, 131–40,

economic instruments, 699

ecosystem management, xii, 39–51

ecosystem services, 15, 98, 444, 455, 469

employees and agents, liability of, 428–29, 788–90

employer, liability, of 200–201

endangered species, 23, 26, 33, 34, 46, 135, 165, 452, 460

*Endangered Species Act*, 23, 26, 112, 123, 609, 612, 613, 623, 624

entry and inspection, powers, 777

Environment and Climate Change Canada, 40, 221, 296, 370, 371, 416, 418, 445, 462, 694–96, 760

environmental assessment law, 8; federal process, 74; framework, 64; future of, 8; Ontario process 64; principles and evolution, 64

environmental assessment, 8, 98–99, 134, 135, 253, 281, 552, 592, 608, 614, 620, 747

*Environmental Assessment Act* (Ontario), 64, 253

environmental assessment and review process, 156

environmental audit, 382–83, 642, 700, 780–81, 794

*Environmental Bill of Rights* (Ontario), 1993 64, 125, 256

Environmental Commissioner, 256, 802

environmental concerns, 4, 66, 167, 251, 613, 725  
 environmental damages, 163  
 environmental ethics, 61  
 environmental harm and economics, 443–54; 457–68  
 environmental impact assessments, 98, 99, 281  
 environmental investigations, 742–50  
 environmental law, 64, 65, 72, 73, 143, 144, 149, 152, 154–56, 187, 443, 445, 473, 477; component goals, 64–65, 282; international law, relevance to, 102; key components of, 224; tort law, 195, 231  
 environmental norms, 131  
 environmental prosecutions, 173  
 environmental protection, 227, 282, 309, 309, 325, 337, 367, 369, 416, 437, 608, 693, 742; use of compliance audits, 780  
*Environmental Protection Act* (Ontario) 21, 205, 238, 252, 254, 273, 281, 353, 473, 652, 708, 724  
*Environmental Protection and Enhancement Act* (Alberta), 48, 107, 212, 237, 246, 252, 394, 416, 418, 420, 609, 613, 615  
*Environmental Quality Act* (Quebec), 724  
 Environmental Review Tribunal, 25, 205, 335, 478, 530, 536, 591, 597, 711–12  
 environmental sentencing, 66  
 errors of law, 182, 272, 274–77, 354, 515; generally 274–75. *See also* mistake of law  
 evidence, 177–86, 203, 204, 234–23; evidence continuity 574–81; evidentiary barriers to standing 582; evidentiary issues in environmental prosecutions and hearings 471  
 experts, 481–92; 493–503; 532–48, 561–73; expert evidence, 516, 531, 551–59

## F

federal jurisdiction, 144, 207, 621  
 federal v provincial Crowning, 207–17  
 First Nations, 137, 242, 243, 298, 608, 615. *See also* Indigenous peoples  
 Fisheries and Oceans Canada, 368, 370–71, 694

*Fisheries Act*, 22, 26, 28, 29, 179, 183–85, 219, 222, 225, 249, 262, 269, 314, 369, 622, 694, 695  
 fisheries sector, 694  
 foreseeability, 188, 189, 193, 265, 378, 721, 757  
*Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act* (Ontario), 245  
 fundamental justice, 77; abuse of process, 243, 272–76, 279, 581; improper exercise of prosecutorial discretion, 176, 194, 246, 325

## G

gathering expert evidence, 597–604  
 government action/inaction, 10, 100  
 government officials, liability of, 255, 354  
 guidelines, 108, 395, 418, 783, 788

## H

habitat loss, 199  
 hazardous waste, 200, 678, 730  
 hearsay evidence, 599  
 human rights and environmental law, 72

## I

impact assessments. *See* Environmental impact assessments  
 Indigenous legal traditions, 82  
 Indigenous peoples, 82, 89, 137–38, 285, 286, 287, 291, 292, 295, 303, 607, 617, 621, 622, 633  
 initiation of action, 708–16  
 injunction, 6, 33, 56, 68, 298, 347, 701  
 inspections, 178–80, 198, 663–85, 785; inspections and searches, 178; inspections vs. investigations, 709  
 Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, 253, 646  
 international environmental law, 152–60  
 international law, 102, 142–49  
 intragovernmental aspects of prosecutions, 218



## J

joint prosecutions, 211  
judicial notice of climate change, 646–58  
judicial review, 23–24, 26–27, 54, 66, 134–35,  
137, 13, 153, 158, 240, 244, 592, 612, 638  
judicial treatment of regulatory offences: plea-  
bargaining, 315  
jurisdiction, 201, 207, 208, 245

## L

land use planning, 112, 113, 126, 615, 624,  
690, 691  
laws of general application, 343, 699  
Law of the Sea Treaty, 36  
leave to appeal, 23, 71, 186, 190, 260, 501,  
591–92, 659, 750  
legislative reform, 593  
liability, 57, 77, 189, 194, 329, 428

## M

marine protection: conservation areas, 608,  
614; protected areas, 98, 132, 490, 617  
*mens rea*, 231, 263, 715  
mistake of law: defence of officially induced  
error, 182, 272, 274, 276  
monetary administrative penalties, 338  
*Municipal Act* (Ontario), 259

## N

national parks, 131–39, 385. *See also* Parks  
Canada  
National Pollutant Release Inventory, 613  
necessity, defence of, 279–80; defined 279–80  
negligence, 55, 187  
negotiating sentences, 425–35  
non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and  
creative sentencing, 413–22  
North American Agreement on  
Environmental Cooperation, 148, 694,  
705  
nuisance, 52–59

## O

Oceans. *See* Fisheries and Oceans Canada  
oil and gas, 72, 398  
Ontario Municipal Board, 650  
*Ontario Water Resources Act*, 125, 231, 247,  
253, 256, 273, 327, 475, 480, 670, 677, 688,  
689, 708, 716, 724, 739

## P

Parks Canada, 133–39. *See also* ecosystem  
management; national parks  
participation rights, 537, 589  
penalties, 338–58, 684, 685  
pollution prevention, 65, 220, 222, 368, 613,  
694, 695  
precautionary principle, 17–36, 97  
preventive measures orders, 709  
private actions, 58  
private prosecutions, 240–56  
privilege in environmental enforcement,  
634–44  
procedural fairness, 354, 535  
prosecutions, 173–85  
prosecutorial discretion, 175–85, 194, 246, 325  
provincial parks, 58, 125  
public interest standing, 584–87, 591, 593  
public international law, 152  
public lands, 45, 46  
public nuisance, 52–57, 59, 584–85  
public participation, 2, 5–7, 10  
Public Prosecution Service of Canada, 224

## Q

quasi-judicial, 352, 588, 700, 701, 702

## R

*R v. City of Sault Ste. Marie*. *See* *Sault Ste.  
Marie* (case), 365, 369, 440, 449  
reasonable care, defence of, 180, 181, 353, 477,  
722–24, 756–57; relationship to acts of  
God, 181  
reasonable person, 26, 264, 275, 333, 354  
recapitulation, 752–75; 776–92

record, 85, 237  
regulatory inspections, 690–98  
regulatory negligence, 187–95  
remedial orders, 393, 439  
remedy, 53–59, 68  
reporting obligations to third parties, 505–14  
responsive regulation, 665–87

## S

*Sault Ste. Marie* (case), 177, 183, 200, 244, 254, 263, 272, 336, 353, 714, 721  
special damages, 56  
species at risk, 155, 158, 612  
*Species at Risk Act*, 22, 29, 65, 155, 238, 247, 252  
specific deterrence, 456  
standard of care, 188, 365, 765  
standard of proof, 231, 232, 234, 264, 582, 584–92  
standard of review, 521, 620  
standard setting, 690; enforcement 690  
standing, 53, 582, 586; evidentiary barriers 582–93  
statutory due diligence defences, 267  
statutory interpretation, 29, 75, 139, 149, 153, 201  
strategic decisions in environmental prosecutions, 197–206  
strict liability (offences), 68, 177, 197, 231, 232, 263, 720; defence of reasonable care (*see* reasonable care, defence of); defences, 268; errors of law, acts of God 354; generally, 263; other defences 253, 263  
subsidiary, 747  
substantive environmental rights, 74, 240  
sustainable development, 1–10, 104; forest resources, 118, 127; intergenerational equity, 9, 64, 96, 97; oceans, 107; operationalizing 11, 92; precautionary principle, 2  
sustainability, 92–127  
sustainability statutes, 104–28  
*Sustainable Development Act* (Manitoba), 10, 12, 51, 64, 99, 106, 109

## T

tort law, 195, 231  
*Toxic Substances List*, 220  
training, 382  
*Transportation of Dangerous Goods Act*, 374, 375  
treaty, 97, 103, 144–50  
trespass, 67, 68, 655, 661  
tribunal, 205, 336, 352; evidence, 177–86, 203, 204, 234–37; judicial review of tribunal decisions, 23, 24, 27, 54, 134, 240; natural justice, and, 619; parties, 54, 103, 231, 699; procedural fairness, and, 354, 535  
Truth and Reconciliation Commission Calls to Action, 299

## U

UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, 298  
UN Framework Convention on Climate Change, 11

## V

voluntary compliance, 393, 680, 700, 742, 754, 767

## W

watershed management, 42–45, 47, 49–51  
wetlands, 28, 42, 328  
wildlife sector. Aboriginal rights, 622; migratory birds, 155, 221  
wildlife statutes: species at risk, 22, 50, 65, 155, 158, 241, 612, 616, 629  
whistleblowers, 198, 636, 743, 790, 791, 797  
World Commission on Environment and Development, 2, 4, 8, 94



Canadian environmental law is a dynamic and exciting area that is playing an increasingly important role in furthering sustainable development policy. Environmental law has distinctive principles and distinctive provincial and federal statutes and regulations. These must be appreciated both within the legal community and by all those who are concerned about the way that courts and tribunals resolve environmental disputes.

*Environment in the Courtroom* provides extensive insight into Canadian environmental law. Covering key environmental concepts and the unique nature of environmental damage, environmental prosecutions, sentencing and environmental offences, evidentiary issues in court and in hearings, issues associated with site inspections, investigations, and enforcement, and more, this collection has the potential to make a significant difference in the level of understanding and practice.

Providing perspective and insight from experienced and prominent Canadian legal practitioners and scholars, *Environment in the Courtroom* addresses the Canadian provinces and territories and provides context by comparison to the United States and Australia. No other collection of practical papers covers these topics so comprehensively. This is an essential reference for all those interested in Canadian environmental law.

**ALLAN E. INGELSON** is an associate professor in the Faculty of Law, University of Calgary, and Executive Director of the Canadian Institute of Resources Law. His research focuses on Canadian and international energy, mining, and environmental issues.



UNIVERSITY OF CALGARY  
Press

[press.ucalgary.ca](http://press.ucalgary.ca)